The Poems of Thomas Hardy as Song

Megan J. Prictor

Thomas Hardy (1840-1928) is more widely known for his novels than for his poems. The latter, numbering several hundred, were published late in his life, in eight collections spanning the period 1898-1928. They are noticeably less political than his novels, and are marked by elements of the English pastoral, as exemplified in the opening stanza of the poem 'Weathers':

This is the weather the cuckoo likes,
And so do I;
When showers betumble the chestnut spikes,
And nestlings fly:
And the little brown nightingale bills his best,
And they sit outside at 'The Travellers' Rest',
And maids come forth sprig-muslin drest,
And citizens dream of the south and west,
And so do I.¹

The publication of Hardy’s poems was met with such ambivalence that his efforts were later described as having ‘considerable merit, but there is little agreement as to where it is to be found’.² The unique and somewhat parochial nature of Hardy’s language and style—which will be discussed further—commonly evoked diverse and often unfavourable critical responses. Paradoxically however, it gained immense recognition in another sphere, that of musical settings by more than one hundred composers.

Those by English composer Gerald Finzi (1901-1956) are perhaps the most well known and frequently performed. Finzi set six complete cycles and numerous single songs and sketches, which makes him the most prolific composer of songs on Hardy’s texts. His affinity with Hardy’s poetry and the importance of these works in terms of the twentieth-century English vocal repertoire have been widely recognized. However, the existence and significance of settings by many other composers have remained largely unknown. Gooch and Thatcher’s catalogue Musical Settings of Late Victorian and Modern British Literature, published in 1976, lists approximately 300 songs and choral settings of Hardy by 111 composers.³ The attraction of so many composers, working in different countries and eras, to the often problematic poems of this parochial poet is a subject worthy of investigation.

The complex style of Hardy’s poetry and his unique treatment of language provide initial hurdles to composition. Words which are remote from everyday use feature prominently; Hardy drew on archaic, rare and dialectal words, as well as inventing and constructing his own. He not only employed unorthodox forms of words, such as ‘limitings’ (limitations), but also created peculiar formations by the addition of prefixes, for example ‘outbreathing’ (breathing out). Critical evaluation ranges from a perception of the poems as ‘craggy and rugged’, to Lytton Strachey’s less generous view that the texts are ‘full of ugly and cumbrous expressions, clumsy metres, and flat, prosaic turns of speech’. Yet in terms of composition, the attraction of the verse lies not only in its significant content, but also in its rich, lively aural qualities.

Thomas Hardy had an ‘inherited and lifelong love of music and song’ which was often reflected in his poetic texts. Some were written in overtly song-like forms, and given titles such as ‘The Market Girl (Country Song)’. However, most of his works, although basically traditional in metre, nevertheless reveal profound variation in all areas of structure. There is a lack of squareness, creating a sense of rhythmic freedom, which is exemplified in the opening stanzas of ‘Paths of Former Time’, published in Moments of Vision (1917):

No; no;
It must not be so:
They are the ways we do not go.

Still chew
'The kine, and moo
In the meadows we used to wander through.'³

These unsymmetrical qualities free the composer
from four-square, balladic settings, but render
detailed reflection of structure in song more com-
plicated. Many have consequently chosen in varying
degrees to ignore Hardy's rhythmic patterns.

Hardy's poems are also infused with his 'dour
philosophy, a mixture of stoicism and fatalism'.
He perceived man as a purposeful being within a
purposeless universe, insignificant in a vast cos-
mos. His poetic creations were underpinned by a
sense of irony and pessimism. This is epitomised,
albeit with some humour, in 'Epitaph on a Pessi-
mist', published in Human Shows (1925):

I'm Smith of Stoke, aged sixty-odd,
I've lived without a dame
From youth-time on; and would to God
My dad had done the same.  

Such irony is compounded by the ambiguity of
Hardy's persona. The speaker is rarely identified,
and may change within the course of a single
poem. This goes some way towards explaining the
preference of many composers for straightforward
anecdotal or reflective texts, such as 'Weathers',
which occurs in at least 23 musical settings. In
contrast, 'The Self-Unseeing', which includes sev-
eral subjects identified only by personal pronouns,
has only found favour with two composers, and of
these, Finzi's setting has been described as 'merely
[skating] across its surface'.

Finzi developed a profound interest in English
poetry, particularly that of Hardy. Burton Parker
notes that 'of the approximately 61 published Finzi
songs, 43 of them have texts by Hardy'. His first
Hardy cycle was By Footpath and Stile op. 2
(1921-2) for baritone and string quartet. A Young
Man's Exhortation op. 14 (1933) for tenor, bor-
rrowed its title from the Hardy poem of the same
name, published in Late Lyrics and Earlier in
1922. The title of Earth and Air and Rain op. 15
(1936) for baritone, was derived from a verse in the
poem 'Proud Songsters', published in 1928, while
Before and After Summer op. 16 (1949) for bar-
tone was also the name of a poem in the 1924
collection Satires of Circumstance. Two works
were published posthumously: Till Earth Outwears
op. 19a (1958) for high voice, and I Said to Love
op. 19b (1958) for low voice, the latter deriving
its title from a poem of the same name which
appeared in Hardy's Poems of the Past and the
Present (1902).

Finzi believed the primary consideration in song
composition 'is that a composer is...moved by a
poem and wishes to identify himself with it and
share it'. His remarkable affinity with Hardy's
poetry has frequently been ascribed to a similarity
in their personalities. Finzi was plagued by 'a deep
and fundamental pessimism', which found reso-
nance in the irony of Hardy's texts. His songs are
also significant for the sensitive manner in which
music and text have been united. Hardy's unique
and often difficult poetic style has been translated
by Finzi 'into music that seems not only appropri-
ate but utterly inevitable'.

Benjamin Britten (1913-1976) composed a cy-
cle of eight songs on texts by Hardy entitled Winter
Words op. 52 (1953). Its title was borrowed from
that of Hardy's final collection of poems, pub-
lished in 1928. Like Finzi, Britten demonstrated a
profound understanding of and concern for the
English language in musical setting. In his Hardy
songs he 'avoided all touch of the dreaded English
pastoral', and confronted Hardy’s pessimism and
doubt.

Possibly the only song by Fritz Hart (1874-
1949) on a text by Hardy was included in his Five
Songs for Voice and Pianoforte op. 120 (1938) and
entitled 'When I set out for Lyonnesse'. Hart's
song technique is marked by 'sensitivity' and a
'regard for verse form and verbal inflection'.

In analysing a selection of Hardy songs, I have
attempted to pass some judgement on the validity
of various settings. The main musical elements for
examination are those of melody, harmony and
tonality, rhythm and metre, and structure, texture
and word painting as they are treated in both voice
and accompaniment. The manner in which com-
posers have interpreted the text, and its relation-
ship with the music is of primary concern.

'When I set out for Lyonnesse': Finzi and Hart.

When I set out for Lyonnesse,
A hundred miles away,
The rime was on the spray,
And starlight lit my lonesomeness
When I set out for Lyonnesse,
A hundred miles away.

What would bechance at Lyonnesse
While I should sojourn there
No prophet durst declare,
Nor did the wisest wizard guess
What would bechance at Lyonnesse
While I should sojourn there.
When I came back from Lyonnesse
With magic in my eyes,
All marked with mute surmise
My radiance rare and fathomless,
When I came back from Lyonnesse
With magic in my eyes!\[^{19}\]

Hardy wrote the poem 'When I set out for Lyonnesse' in 1870, following a trip to St. Juliot, Cornwall, where he first met his future wife Emma Lavinia Gifford.\[^{20}\] It was published in 1914 in his collection entitled *Satires of Circumstance*. Lyonnesse is the Romance name for the north Cornwall of Arthurian legend,\[^{21}\] and is the location for a number of poems concerning this significant journey. 'When I set out for Lyonnesse' has been described as 'a gay, lilting poem, charged with the spirit of romance and young love'.\[^{22}\] Not surprisingly, at least thirteen musical versions exist. It is among Hardy's less complex texts, marked by relative clarity of meaning and form, although 'What would bechance at Lyonnesse' is never identified. It consists of three six-line stanzas, in which lines 1 and 2 recur as lines 5 and 6. The stanzaic form can thus be represented as simply as A B A, and the rhyming form as a b b a a b.

Finzi's setting appeared as the second song in his *Earth and Air and Rain* cycle.\[^{23}\] It accurately represents the poem's three stanzas in modified ternary form; A (bars 1-22) B (bars 23-42) A' (bars 42-64). This simple structure is clearly defined by a distinctive phrase in the piano, which is introduced as a prelude, recurs between each stanza and as a postlude (Example 1). However, it is noteworthy that the straightforward verse structure has been treated with some variation by Finzi. Hardy structured each of the three stanzas identically with regard to beats per line and number of lines per stanza. Finzi has differentiated between them, most noticeably by providing a divergent number of bars of vocal melody per stanza.

While the first and third stanzas concern the poet's journey to and from Lyonnesse, the second hints at events which occurred during his 'sojourn there'. Finzi utilises contrasting musical material to delineate the resultant changes in atmosphere. The descending quaver ostinato in the bass, suggesting walking (see Example 1), is absent in the central section, and returns in the final section. The texture of the second verse is appropriately less linear and more chordal. It features even crotchet and quaver rhythms, and a solid accompa-
the highest note of the song combines with the interest provided by a unique rhythmic figure on the word ‘magic’, to emphasize the joy in the speaker’s sparkling eyes (Example 3).


Finzi has also differentiated between the vocal melodies of each verse to emphasize the transformation in poetic atmosphere. In the first and third verses the vocal line is similar, although in the latter some figures are changed to reflect the speaker’s greater confidence, his ‘radiance rare and fathomless’. However, the melody of the second verse contrasts markedly in both rhythmic and intervallic patterns. A comparison of the opening lines of the first and second stanzas in Finzi’s setting is indicative of these changes (see Example 2). The fluent triplet figure featured in voice and piano in the first and third stanzas is replaced by a somewhat more formal duple rhythm. Similarly, each stanza is provided with new tonality. The song begins in E minor, changing to E major during the first piano interlude. Following the second stanza, it moves into E flat major, returning to E minor during the last line of text to match the cyclic progression of the narrative.

Word painting is evident throughout the work, in both overt and more subtle ways. The walking figure in the bass combines with the Tempo di Marcia marking to leave us in no doubt as to the speaker’s method of transport. In the final verse, the poems of Thomas Hardy as song


Of particular interest is the recurrence of ‘Lyonesse’, which is imbued with significance through melodic changes which subtly transform the mood. Its rhythm never alters, despite the appearance in the second verse of duple motion which replaces the overall triplet metre of the first and third verses. In the opening section, the stepwise descending minor third on the word ‘Lyonesse’ emphasizes the E minor tonality, creating a sense of uncertainty and foreboding reinforced by the piano’s Misterioso marking (see Example 2). In the B section, the confidence of the E major tonality is consolidated by the settings of ‘Lyonesse’ to a descending perfect fifth (Example 4) and major third. In the final section, the ‘radiance rare and fathomless’ of the speaker is illuminated by the setting of ‘Lyonesse’ to a stepwise descending motion from the dominant to
the mediant tone, establishing a carefree and joyful mood (see Example 4). This demonstrates both Finzi’s attention to detail and his sensitivity to changing textual and harmonic colours.

Like Finzi, Hart maintains the clear delineation of three separate stanzas of verse. However, his setting is strophic, in contrast to Finzi’s modified ternary form.

The changes of mood expressed in the text are predominantly delineated by the accompaniment rather than the voice. In the second verse, the piano part is an exact repetition of the first verse. It features undulating quaver chords in both hands (Example 5), their relentless motion continuing even during the few bars of sparser texture. In the final verse, the preceding accompaniment figure is not wholly abandoned. However, an upward scalar figure which incorporates the comparative irregularity of a dotted quaver-semiquaver rhythm provides interest, and reflects the atmosphere of ‘magic’ and ‘surprise’.

In the vocal part, the few differences existing between verses indicate Hart’s sensitivity to the pronunciation of particular words. For example, the phrase ‘And starlight lit my lonesomeness’ in verse one is set to a slightly different rhythm from that of the corresponding phrase in verse two ‘Nor did the wisest wizard guess’ (Example 6). These subtle variations of rhythm indicate the composer’s awareness of changes in verbal accent, and the development of atmosphere in the narrative, despite the apparent simplicity of his strophic setting.

Hart marked his version Con moto, no doubt in response to the confident text and the implication of a walking motion. The undulating quaver figure in the piano similarly reflects this mode of travel. Due to the repetition of melody and rhythm between verses, there is little evidence of other word painting in the vocal part. Instead, it is the piano which comments on the text and appropriately depicts changes of atmosphere. It begins a brief

---


Fritz Hart was also attracted to ‘When I set out for Lyonnesse’ as a song text. His setting of the poem was completed in February 1938, and incorporated as the second song in his unpublished collection Five Songs for Voice and Piano op. 120.
The poems of Thomas Hardy as song

Example 6a: Fritz Hart, 'When I set out for Lyonesse', bars 10-11


prelude with a single semibreve on e'. Marked mezzo piano, the extreme sparseness of this opening creates a sense of uncertainty which is relevant to the speaker's 'lonesomeness'. At the song's conclusion in a confident G major, the piano sounds the ascending scale figure followed by mezzo forte minim chords which finish securely on the tonic. This short section is notable for its escape from the relentless quaver walking figure, implying that both the subject and the song have come to rest. The modulation from minor key to relative major similarly reflects the speaker's new-found sense of optimism.

The most striking feature of this setting is its shifting harmonic colours. Parallel fourths and fifths form a large proportion of the accompaniment, exemplified by the opening bars (see Example 5), and chords featuring a minor seventh are common. The undulating motion of the E minor seventh chord in the prelude creates a wash of harmonically static colour. Each verse moves through E minor, B major, E major and B flat Major before returning to E minor, with the exception of the third which concludes in G major. Considering that the verses each contain only thirteen bars of vocal melody, this tonal shift is rapid. Hart's somewhat impressionistic style, while not unsuccessful, may have been more suited to one of Hardy's less narrative, more oblique poems.

Hart's version of 'When I set out for Lyonesse' indicates his awareness of the transformation of the poet's perspective during the progression of the three stanzas. However, in choosing a strophic form he has employed an inappropriate means of expressing this transformation. Hart's musical differentiation between the stanzas is meagre in comparison with that of Finzi's setting. In basic structure they are not dissimilar, mirroring the poem's stanzaic divisions and incorporating brief piano interludes to clarify its form. However, Finzi's song is imbued with a jaunty, ballad-like atmosphere by the bass 'walking' theme and recurring triplet figures. Hart's setting is marked by more complex harmonies and unimaginative structural repetition. While it may be seen as having more harmonic interest and colour differentiation than Finzi's version, less attention has been paid to the text. Finzi's setting demonstrates much greater variety of rhythm, melody, texture and word painting, and these features lend vivid musical interest to Hardy's simple poem.
"Proud Songsters": Britten and Finzi.

The thrushes sing as the sun is going,
And the finches whistle in ones and pairs,
And as it gets dark loud nightingales
In bushes
Pipe, as they can when April wears,
As if all Time were theirs.

These are brand new birds of twelvemonths' growing,
Which a year ago, or less than twain,
No finches were, nor nightingales,
Nor thrushes,
But only particles of grain,
And earth, and air, and rain.24

"Proud Songsters" was published in 1928 as the second poem in Hardy's collection entitled Winter Words.25 It is in a pastoral vein, describing noisy, busy birds in the context of the continuing cycle of death and rebirth. The poem is consistent with the typical motion of Hardy's poetry; in this case moving from a description of the birds to a reflection on the brevity of life. The challenge to composers then, is to capture both the simplicity and the significance of Hardy's vision.

Only two composers are known to have set "Proud Songsters". Not surprisingly, Finzi was one of them, including it in his op.15 cycle as the final song, and drawing the cycle's title Earth and Air and Rain from the poem's final line. Britten also completed a setting which appeared in his Winter Words cycle op.52 (1954).26 This setting has sometimes been regarded as the more effective musical realization of the text. Trevor Hold compares them thus:

The contrast between the two could hardly be more striking. Finzi's setting lasts over three minutes, whilst Britten's is over and done with in little more than one. Finzi stresses the 'human' side of the poem, the sadness inherent in the fact that these 'brand new birds of twelve months' growing' will soon be no more than 'earth and air and rain'. Besides it, Britten's 'ebulliently happy' piece might appear trivial—until you appreciate that Britten is, as it were, being the birds...who are quite oblivious of their situation.27

The extent of atmospheric word-painting in Britten's setting clearly contributed to Hold's impression of the song as wholly carefree. Marked 'Impetuous', its 5/4 metre and irregular rhythmic patterns in voice and accompaniment combine to suggest the birds hopping about. The piano's high tessitura—both hands are in the treble until bar 20—as well as its frequent trills, discordant major seconds and triplet figuration are strongly reminiscent of birdsong. In particular, it evokes the sound of several different species of birds singing simultaneously, as are described in the opening lines of the poem.

However Hold, in his perception that the birds are 'quite oblivious of their situation' overlooks the increasing implications of a rather poignant philosophy which underpins Britten's setting. The birds may not be aware of their origin and fate, but the speaker of the poem certainly is. Britten's recognition of this fact is intimated in the increasing chromaticism of the second verse. The song begins in E flat major, remaining within a diatonic frame for much of the opening verse. However, the first implication of uncertainty, heralded with the line 'As if all time were theirs', is matched by the introduction of harmonic inflection in both voice and accompaniment. The second stanza is marked by increasing harmonic freedom. Modifications to C major and B flat major on the first and second lines appropriately reflect the speaker's broadening perspective, while the reprise of the opening melody, now in the tonic minor at the poem's penultimate line, infuses his reflections with pathos.

Hardy's poem features irregular line-lengths and rhythms, which Britten deals with skilfully. His repetition of the word 'Pipe' in bars 11-12 improves the melodic fluency, and in no way disturbs the meaning of the text. The setting contains long, arch-shaped phrases with much conjunct motion, enabling the clear vocalization of the poem. The composer's voice—that is, his reading of the text and contribution to the emotional and significant content of the final musical-poetic creation—in this case appears predominantly in the accompaniment, and chromatic inflection of the vocal melody. At two points, however, brief melismas reveal the importance which Britten attributed to key words. In this largely syllabic setting, the upward chromatic phrase on 'time' in bar 5, and the see-sawing melisma on 'air' in bar 32 (Example 7), attract the listener's attention.
Gerald Finzi's approach to Hardy's poem contrasts markedly with that assumed by Britten. While his version certainly lacks the exuberance of Britten's setting, one commentator's evaluation of Finzi's efforts as 'the work...of a gentleman ornithologist with all the time in the world' is questionable. Rather, Finzi has captured a strong sense of the brevity of life and inevitability of death in this song, and it seems more closely aligned with Hardy's typically pessimistic philosophy than that achieved by Britten.

Somewhat uncharacteristically, Finzi begins 'Proud Songsters' with a fifteen-bar piano prelude which occupies more than a third of the song's total length. This, coupled with its position as the final song in the cycle and the derivation of the cycle's title from its final line, indicates its significance for the composer. He maintains the textual division into two stanzas, expressing this division more definitively than Britten by incorporating a six-bar piano interlude. Both stanzas are provided with eight bars of vocal melody, although the song is through-composed; the second verse is notable for its striking differences in melody, rhythm, style of accompaniment and resultant mood.

Rhythm is an important element which Finzi utilises to comment on the text. The piano prelude introduces a recurring syncopated rhythmic motive, which both contributes to the unity of the piece, and creates a sense of inevitable, relentless forward motion through its anticipation of the beat. Again, unlike many of Finzi's vocal works, 'Proud Songsters' is strongly rhythmic, with only one triplet in bar 16 which disturbs the predominantly duple division of the beat. While in the first vocal stanza the melody only occasionally assumes the accompaniment's motive, it emphasizes the ongoing beat by rhythmically supporting this figure (Example 8).

The second stanza, however, sees a much sparser texture marked by the absence of the preceding rhythmic ostinato. Even crotchet and quaver patterns now dominate. The atmosphere becomes more melancholy, emphasized by the più calma marking. The accompaniment maintains a prominent theme before the final stanza, and in the last lines introduces a lyrical countermelody to the voice. However on the final verse of text, its individual motion ceases, and it follows the rhythm of the voice with simple cadential chords, which focuses the listener's attention on the words.

The overt and cheerful word-painting of Britten's version is noticeably absent. Finzi employs much more subtle means to convey his reading of the text. For example, the tessitura of both the voice and piano parts are generally low. This is particularly evident in bars 12-13 of the prelude, where the entire piano part sinks to several octaves below middle C. The first verse expresses the inevitable progression of time. In Britten's song it was the activities of the birds which claimed our attention. In Finzi's version we are made aware that 'the sun is going' and 'it gets dark'. The only crescendo to forte at the end of the first stanza emphasizes the irony of the phrase 'As if all time were theirs'.

The adoption of fluent crotchet and quaver phrases in the second stanza combines with the lyricism of the melody in accompaniment and voice to create the atmosphere of a simple requiem. The undulating melody on 'earth and air and rain', and its repeated return to ♩ mirrors Hardy's sense of perpetual renewal. However, in the last bars the reappearance of the accompaniment's syncopated figure, as well as a movement away from the suggested D major tonality to that of B minor, establishes once again the sombre inevitability of death.
The versions of ‘Proud Songsters’ by both Finzi and Britten exemplify effective musical responses to the text, although their perspectives regarding of the birds’ activity, hinting at the broadening perspective of the speaker through varying degrees of chromaticism. Finzi, however, attributes much more significance to the perpetual life cycle of nature, and the inevitability of death. In his song, the birds merely exemplify the sadness inherent in time’s onward march. Britten’s setting is focussed upon the illustrative content of this text as a single entity, while Finzi’s ‘Proud Songsters’ is more closely aligned with the overall perspective of Hardy’s entire poetic output.

In being evaluated as more or less attuned to the spirit of the poet, Finzi’s songs could be perceived as having an initial advantage over those by other composers. The sheer quantity of Finzi’s settings of Hardy, and his obvious and much advertised personal affinity with the poet meant that his setting of each of the poems was infused with his understanding of the poet’s overall philosophy. Composers such as Hart or Britten whose settings of Hardy represent only a small proportion of their output for solo voice have tended to demonstrate less awareness of the nuances of meaning in his writings.

Nevertheless, the union of Thomas Hardy’s words with the musical creations of this significant generation of English composers is characterised by richness and expressive depth. Their recognition of the value of the text, and even more a sense of personal connection with the poet, help to establish the unique qualities of this repertoire.

NOTES


4 Trevor Hold, ‘“Checkless Griff” or Thomas Hardy and the Songwriters’, Musical Times 131 (1990), p. 309.


8 Hold, ‘“Checkless Griff” or Thomas Hardy and the Songwriters’, p. 309.


10 Hold, ‘“Checkless Griff” or Thomas Hardy and the Songwriters’, p. 309.


15 Howard Ferguson, jacket notes, Gerald Finzi (1901-1956), Lyrita, SRCS. 38, 1968.


17 It was never published, remaining in manuscript form in the Latrobe Library Manuscripts Collection. All excerpts from Hart’s ‘When I set out for Lyonnesse’ are reproduced by kind permission of the State Library of Victoria.


21 Hynes, ed., Thomas Hardy, p. 510.


23 All excerpts from Finzi’s ‘When I set out for Lyonnesse’ are reproduced by kind permission of Boosey & Hawkes (Australia) on behalf of Boosey & Hawkes London.


26 All excerpts from Britten’s ‘Proud Songsters’ are reproduced by kind permission of Boosey & Hawkes (Australia) on behalf of Boosey & Hawkes London.

27 Hold, ‘“Checkless Griff” or Thomas Hardy and the Songwriters’, p. 310.