

Co-authorship no doubt presents peculiar difficulties, and one of the outcomes is the occasional duplication of information, as in the lengthy section on Chamber Made's *Recital*. It is of great interest to hear what director Horton and composer David Chesworth have to say; the creators' tendency to repeat themselves by way of introduction is easily enough put right with slightly more rigorous editing. The same goes for the sorts of inevitable slip-ups like the attribution to Moya Henderson of *Bride of Fortune* on page 139, despite a lengthy discussion on the work and its actual composer, Gillian Whitehead, on pages 76 and 77.

My only other reservation is one of design: the book contains a wealth of technical material on individual works—such as cast lists and instrumentation—which appears at the head of each section. I'd vote for a contrasting typeface to articulate the text somewhat. But in general it's a handsome volume (thanks, as the publisher graciously notes, to the generosity of designers and the companies themselves). Given the exponential increase in works for the stage, and the lack, hitherto, of any comprehensive discussion of it, this represents a most welcome addition to the shelves.

GORDON KERRY

James Grier, *The Critical Editing of Music: History, Method and Practice*

Cambridge, UK: Cambridge UP, 1996.

ISBN 0-521-55863-8. pp. xi + 267, index, bibl., pb.

James Grier's masterly book on music editing can be recommended to anyone who has ever wondered about the sources and authority of a printed page of music; that is, to scholars and performers as well as practising or aspiring editors. The words "Method and Practice" in the title notwithstanding, this is not in a narrow sense a "how to" book. Rather it is a wonderfully wide-ranging study of editing in which Grier, drawing widely on the ideas of philologists, anthropologists and cultural theorists as well as musicologists, develops a theoretical framework for a critical methodology of editing. The book engages in some critical discourse about the nature of editing, but this need not deter the "theoretically challenged". Grier uses discipline-specific jargon with elegance and clarity and, where appropriate, illustrates his points with editorial conundrums from the standard repertoire.

Grier's starting point, espoused in the Introduction (Chapter 1), is that editing is inescapably an act of criticism, a result of "the interaction between the authority of the composer and the authority of the editor" (p.2). He holds critical interpretation and editing to be inseparable. Even what would appear to be the irreproachably well-intentioned practice of searching for authorial authority can be problematic for much repertoire as a composer's authority can be "affected and limited by the social, political and economic institutions through which these sources are produced and disseminated" (p.3).

After the Introduction, the book is cast in four core chapters (2-5), a brief Conclusion subtitled "the posture of the editor", and an Epilogue, together with Appendices and a very substantial Bibliography. It is the Appendices—printed in uncomfortably minute type—which contain the most prescriptive material for would-be editors on how to get underway: how to locate, inspect and describe sources using the somewhat arcane language of codicology, and how best to transcribe so as all variants are clearly shown. All this is concise and well referenced. The Epilogue makes particularly intriguing reading. It contains three contrasting case studies. In the first Grier—himself an early music specialist—outlines his own approach to making an edition of a work of early 11th-century monophony (copied in the hand of Adémar de Chabannes) and in the process he critiques those of two other scholars. In the second case study he looks at a 1992 edition by Cliff Eisen of Mozart's Symphony in C (K.425), published by Peters, which challenges the authority of the market-leading Neue Mozart-Ausgabe version of 1971, edited by Friedrich Schnapp. While Grier ultimately supports Eisen over Schnapp, he finds much to take issue with, not least the absence of a clearly stated *raison d'être* in Eisen's score. In the third example, Verdi's *Don Carlos*, Grier looks at Ursula Gunther's edition which seeks to accommodate seven discrete versions of the opera, composed over some twenty years, thus acknowledging the legitimacy of the contributions of others besides Verdi—producers, directors, conductors, singers, etc.—as *Don Carlos* underwent a "very public process of socialization" (p. 206).

In the four core chapters of the book, Grier focuses on those principles which lead to a critical theory of editing, and includes a discussion of how criticism interacts with practice and method. Chapter 2 looks at the nature of the musical sources, both as documents with their own historical context and as transmitters of the text, and how these relate to one another. Chapter 3 looks at philological techniques of stemmatic filiation, tracing common errors to discover the relationship of extant versions to each other, to any missing versions, and/or to an authorial original. Grier looks at how this technique can be usefully applied when editing music, but also how its use is limited because of the special nature of music as a text to be performed. Chapter 4 looks at establishing text and in doing so, at dealing with errors and resolving variants. Chapter 5 deals with the presentation of the text, dealing in turn with four types of edition, the facsimile, the printed edition replicating original notation, the controversial interpretative edition and, in greatest depth, the critical edition.

Grier's book should, at the very least, disabuse any reader of the notion that music editors are uninspired toilers, myopically engaged in mechanical tasks. Critical editing is emphatically **not** for those who would maintain "a cool attitude of objectivity" (p.180). Grier communicates some of the joy of the inspired detective work involved in editing, but his abiding message is that the task of the good editor is one that is fundamentally interpretative, though grounded in an intimate knowledge of the music to be edited, the composer and repertory. Aspiring "good editors" will find much to enjoy, assist and inspire in this book.

JENNIFER HILL