Traditional Italian Lineages of Vocal Pedagogy, Including Marchesi/Garcia Influences, in Australia, 1850–1900

Beth Williams

The establishment of the traditional Italian school of singing by European-trained singers was the most substantial influence on the technique and standard of operatic singing in Australia between 1850 and 1900. One of the most visible results of this was the fact that despite Australia’s cultural isolation, several singers who were trained in Australia in this period reached the pinnacle of the international operatic stage. This paper examines briefly the history of the traditional Italian school of singing. It argues that the younger Manuel Garcia’s teaching continues the traditions of this school, and that the lineages of singing and vocal teaching begun in Australia by Isaac Nathan, Lucy Chambers, Pietro Cecchi, Emery Gould, Mary Ellen Christian and Elise Wiedermann formed the basis of many generations of vocal lineage based on traditional Italian principles, affecting vocal aesthetic and technique even in the present day.

The origins of traditional Italian vocal technique may be traced from the fourth century and the work of the Scuola Cantorum. The technique developed considerably during the era of Caccini and Carissimi, when many elements of vocal technique were codified, leading to a period of stability and virtuosity in vocalisation. Since this time, the range of demands which composers have made on the human voice has changed considerably, yet the initial vocal technical training for classical vocal performance at an international standard requires the same stability of vocal tone, as well as flexibility, focus, control over resonance, projection, and musicality as was developed in the traditional Italian school. Technical and aesthetic aspects of vocal pedagogy can be seen clearly to have passed from one generation to the next through the pupil-teacher relationship, and subsequent generations of students may be seen to constitute a ‘lineage’ of vocal pedagogy which encompasses aesthetic, technical, artistic and social dimensions. In this context the term ‘generation’ is used to describe the period of training of a student with a particular teacher—usually five to ten years, and the student’s entry into the professional performance or teaching arena. The vocal lineage ‘generation’ is usually much shorter than a human generation.

The traditional Italian school of singing produced many such generations of vocal lineage, and was not the only nationally identifiable school of vocal technique. Many national schools have developed technical means for achieving vocal sound that agrees with cultural tonal ideals. As the singer and vocal pedagogue Richard Miller says, these can be recognised as distinct pedagogical positions, which it is possible to export, and which even in new locations retain adherence to a set of aesthetic principles that strongly indicate cultural origin. A characterisation of the aesthetic and technical features of the traditional Italian school would identify such traits as the tonal ideal of *chiaroscuro* (being a balance between bright and dark sound), and the postural approach of the singer, who appropriates the 'noble position' with the chest raised and the shoulders back. The Italian-trained singer also utilises specific techniques with regard to breath control. In particular, there is co-ordination of the interrelated muscles and organs of the trunk and neck, the ribs remain well expanded, and the muscles of the epigastrium work in conjunction with the movement of the diaphragm, giving balance between internal and external musculature. Thus it is possible, upon witnessing a performance, to distinguish both physically and aurally features of the traditional Italian school. These characteristics were recognised in France in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, and clear distinctions were made by opera critics between French singers trained in French traditions for instance, and those trained in Italian techniques. Critics in London made the same distinctions between English and Italian operatic techniques. It should be noted that such distinctions are in need of careful qualification today, as the aesthetic ideals of the Italian school have, to a large extent, become the dominant aesthetic of the international operatic community. Cultural tonal ideals in vocal pedagogy do still exist however, and are more prominent in art song where linguistic and cultural factors may permeate text, interpretation, and performance.

A short history of the Garcia family will give the background for the teachers trained in this school who later taught in Australia. The elder Manuel Garcia (1775–1832) was a composer and singer, and by the age of seventeen he was already well known in Spain. His voice was distinctively agile, although it did not gain the power for which he was much admired until after studies in Naples. By 1797, Garcia was singing in the theatre of Cadiz, and by 1807, he was the leading tenor in Madrid, as well as the chief composer and director of the Cadiz theatre. At this point he had reached the pinnacle of his profession in Spain, and the only way that his career could be developed was to go overseas. In 1811 he went to Naples, and studied with Ansani, a student of Porpora, who taught in the traditional Italian method. Garcia was one of the foremost singers of his generation. Rossini wrote Almaviva's role in *Il Barbiere di

---

3 Miller, *National Schools* 37.
Siviglia with him in mind. Once he could no longer perform as a singer, Garcia taught in Paris. His most successful pupils were his daughter Maria Malibran, and Adolphe Nourrit, who became one of the most famous tenors in the world. Garcia also taught his son, the younger Manuel Garcia, who became internationally renowned as a singing teacher.

The younger Garcia experimented with vocal pedagogy. He invented the laryngoscope by means of which the physical workings of the larynx could be viewed for the first time, which was also revolutionary in the understanding of the structure of the throat as far as medical science was concerned. He developed the controversial theory of the coup de glotte whereby air pressure was thought to cause the ‘attack’ of the vocal cords, which was required to produce the bel canto tone.\(^{10}\) (Traditional Italian teachers have since interpreted this as meaning that the onset of tone should be a subtle but audible sound).\(^{11}\) The younger Garcia taught many famous singers and teachers including Julius Stockhausen, Mathilde Marchesi, and Jenny Lind. Mathilde Marchesi studied with Garcia for four years, and as a result of Garcia’s support and her own abilities, she became highly sought after as a teacher.\(^{12}\) Marchesi did not seek to change or experiment with her understanding of Garcia’s vocal technique, rather to establish the most successful vocal school that she could, based on his principles. Garcia and Marchesi taught many singers who later established themselves as teachers in Australia; their teaching was so famous in the late nineteenth-century that they were held up as an example to singers all over the world.

There is no difference in an aesthetic sense between the Marchesi/Garcia school and the traditional Italian school. The distinction is purely historical, in that singers and teachers of singing who trained with either the elder or the younger Manuel Garcia, or with Mathilde Marchesi, were known specifically for their association with the Marchesi/Garcia school. Their influence and dissemination in Europe, Australia, and America can be evaluated separately from the rest of the traditional Italian school. In this sense the Marchesi/Garcia school can be classified simply as a sub-set of this school.

There is an alternative opinion to this position, most notably expressed by Lucie Manen, an outspoken critic of the younger Garcia and his work. Manen asserts that Garcia took over his father’s ‘école Garcia’ in Paris without the skill to support its reputation, and that he was consumed with jealousy at the success of his father and sisters.\(^{13}\) She argues that Garcia’s anatomical understanding was based on insufficient information, and that he ‘saw the vocal folds in a horizontal position, but lacking current knowledge of anatomy and physiology he was unaware that insertion of the laryngoscope into the throat altered the position of the various parts.’\(^{14}\) She contends that this incomplete understanding led to significant differences in the pedagogy of father and son, which constituted a mutilation of traditional bel canto methods. In Manen’s consideration of the differences between the technical approach of the two Garcias, she finds fault with the order and thus priority of exercises for the onset of vocal

---


\(^{11}\) Miller, *National Schools* 37.

\(^{12}\) Marchesi’s students include Antoinetta Frici, IIma di Murska, Gabriele Krauss, Anna Radeke, Etelka Gerster, Julia Kulp, Eulalia Risley, Rosa Papier, Emma Nevada, Clementine Proksa, Emma Calve, Nellie Melba, Emma Eames, Sybil Sanderson, Susan Adams, Esther Palisser, Ada Crossley, Frances Saville, Frances Alda and Selma Kurz.


\(^{14}\) Manen, *Bel Canto* 8.
sound in the younger Garcia's 1840 *Traite complet de l'art du chant*. She also mentions the absence of consideration of the ‘special manner of using the upper air passages’ in Garcia’s manuals of singing, which she claims was a first principle of bel canto technique and teaching. Many of Manen’s pupils as both scholars and singers are advocates of a similar view on the pedagogical position in the teaching of the younger Garcia, and form a body of opposition to Garcia’s inclusion in the traditional Italian school.

In response to Manen’s position, it is important to remember that Manen, as a student of Anna Schoen-Rene (a pupil of Pauline Viardot-Garcia), considered herself a lineal descendant of the elder Garcia’s school, and as such stood to gain credit if it could be proven that only her method of pedagogy was a true representation of the original method. Manen’s consideration of Garcia’s singing treatises ignores much of the main body of his work, including his detailed instruction in the dramatic expression of text, codification of registral unity, and explanation of the physiology of breath control and its application in singing. Analysis of the technical aspects of pedagogy based purely on the examination of treatises also has limitations as a means of discrediting the work of an important pedagogue. Current studies suggest that much of what is significant in the pupil-teacher relationship, particularly in musical studies, is based on body language, facial expression, mimicry, and other non-verbal components of communication. The many years of vocal training that the younger Garcia had spent with his father, with the castrato Vitelli, and with other professional singers and writers for the voice, produced in him a well-formed aural aesthetic which was ideal for his life as a teacher, and which he used to great advantage in addition to his extensive investigations into the anatomical processes involved in vocal production. The fact that Garcia (according to press reviews of his performances) was not well-endowed vocally was irrelevant to his work as a singing teacher, such was his knowledge of the voice. Garcia’s success as a teacher, the incredible number of singers belonging to his lineage, and the international recognition of his understanding of vocal technique demonstrate his mastery of the teaching situation.

Manen’s own research into overtones and airflow directions in vocal production are themselves indebted to the work of the younger Garcia, even if her objections to his methodology formed a basis for her work. Manen’s experiments have provided the basis for significant changes in vocal pedagogy, which today is influenced by vastly different theoretical ideas than it was in the era of Garcia and Viardot, particularly in the use of spectrographic analysis of sound waves, and assessment of the singer’s formant in the process of teaching by some teachers. Manen’s assertion that it is not known if any of Garcia’s pupils at the Royal Academy of Music subsequently became famous is also questionable, as it is widely

15 Manen, Bel Canto 8.
14 Even this is questionable, as it is now known that Pauline Viardot studied mainly with her mother Joaquina Garcia, being too young to begin proper vocal training while her father was alive.
documented that Garcia had many successful pupils, who became both performers and
teachers. Manen’s ideas on vocal production are widely considered ‘interesting and fairly
unconventional’ in current medical and vocal historical scholarship, which situates her rebuttal
of Garcia’s work in a contemporary physiological and pedagogical perspective.\textsuperscript{21} Scholars of
historical voice pedagogy such as Dr Berton Coffin also clearly establish the links between the
members of the Garcia family, their pupils, and the traditional Italian school.\textsuperscript{22} Coffin has
considered the differences between many historical vocal treatises in detail, making
comparisons in particular between the work of Manuel Garcia I, and II, and concluding that
there is a clear continuity.

The influence of particular strands of traditional technique in Australia is clarified in Figure
1, which serves as a reference point for the following discussion of the work of Italian-trained
singers and teachers, and helps to put the lineage into perspective both historically and in
terms of vocal generations. The names in bold signify the teacher or teachers responsible for
the following generation.

The earliest prominent teacher of traditional Italian vocal technique in Australia was Isaac
Nathan, composer and singer, who had been apprenticed to Domenico Corri (a student of
Porpora), in London. Nathan had a sweet tenor voice, which, although it was exceptionally
well trained, was not of sufficient volume that he could sing in opera. He tried for many years
to earn a living in London through composition, singing and teaching voice, but was placed
in extreme financial difficulty by the death in childbirth of his patroness, heiress to the throne
Princess Charlotte, in 1817.\textsuperscript{23} He came to Australia in 1841, arriving first in Melbourne, where
he gave some concerts with his family, and then moved to Sydney in April.\textsuperscript{24} Nathan advertised
his services as a teacher of singing in Sydney, and began to establish the traditional Italian
school in Australia. Some of Nathan’s students in Sydney were his children and grandchildren
including Harry and Alfred Nathan (who were respected singers making regular concert
contributions),\textsuperscript{25} Anne Ximenes (née Winstanley), Miss Strickland,\textsuperscript{26} Miss Eliza Wallace (sister
to Vincent Wallace, the composer of \textit{Maritata}),\textsuperscript{27} and Madame Carandini (née Burgess) (who
also studied with the English contralto Sara Flower when she visited Sydney).\textsuperscript{28}

The influence of Nathan’s teaching during this period was far reaching, as several of his
pupils subsequently became teachers and produced ongoing lineages of students. Eliza Wallace
also made a successful career as a singer. On her appearance in Exeter Hall, London in 1847
she received favourable reviews, the \textit{Musical World} commenting:

\begin{quote}
Miss Wallace is really a true artiste. She has a splendid soprano voice, clear, brilliant,
powerful and flexible, and sings with irreproachable taste and judgement. Her voice,
\end{quote}
### Figure 1: Lineages of Vocal Pedagogy

**GARCIA FAMILY LINEAGE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GEN 1</th>
<th>ISAAC PIETRO GARCIA FAMILY LINEAGE</th>
<th>PIETRO ROMANI LINEAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GEN 2</td>
<td>Porpora</td>
<td>Ansani</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Domenico</td>
<td>Corri</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEN 3</td>
<td>Garcia I</td>
<td>Isaac Nathan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pietro Romani</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEN 4</td>
<td>Garcia II</td>
<td>Emery Gould</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Eliza Wallace</td>
<td>Pieter Cecchi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Maria Carandini</td>
<td>Lucy Chambers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GEN 5</th>
<th>Mary-Ellen Christian</th>
<th>Mathilde Marchesi</th>
<th>Dr Arnold Smith</th>
<th>Lucy Benson</th>
<th>Jane Raper</th>
<th>Alice Rees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Stockhausen</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ida Osborne</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bartie</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Marie St Clair</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Charles</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Santley *</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GEN 6</th>
<th>Ella Caspers</th>
<th>Frances Aida</th>
<th>Frank Down</th>
<th>Mrs Gilbert Wilson §</th>
<th>Stella Power</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kate Rooney</td>
<td>Evelyn Scotney</td>
<td>Neville</td>
<td>Lempriere</td>
<td>Pringle ¶</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Marie Narelle</td>
<td>Anne Marie Quesnal</td>
<td>Peter</td>
<td>Dawson</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Molly de Gunst</td>
<td>Ada Crossley</td>
<td>Adolf</td>
<td>Friedman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Melba</td>
<td>Elise Wiedermann</td>
<td>Margaret</td>
<td>Nickson</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GEN 7</th>
<th>Florence Austral</th>
<th>Lisa Gasteen</th>
<th>Lucie Howell</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mary Campbell</td>
<td>Helen Donaldson</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lois Zucker</td>
<td>Natalie Jones</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| GEN 8 | Anne Williams | Molly McGurk |

* Santley also studied with Gaetano Nava.
† Maria Carandini’s daughter.
§ Rosina Palmer’s daughter.
¶ Identified as Neville by ‘Leipsic,’ Sydney Mail 29 Sep. 1900: 736.
too, has considerable compass, and may be said to unite the two registers of soprano and mezzo-soprano. Miss Wallace is also a first rate dramatic artiste. She made the greatest hit we have witnessed for many years at Exeter Hall.\(^{29}\)

In demonstrating the use of a wide vocal range in a rich voice, which was also able to encompass flexibility and expression, Eliza Wallace was able to affirm the effectiveness of Nathan's technical preparation, and his affinity with the traditional Italian school. Wallace later taught singing in Sydney herself, and produced several generations of vocalists through her pupil Jane Raper.\(^{30}\) Raper was acclaimed as a teacher in Sydney, and was prominent in musical events of the city.\(^{31}\)

Another Nathan pupil was Maria Carandini (1826–1894), who also studied with Sara Flower and Eliza Wallace-Bushelle.\(^{32}\) She sang with Mrs Clarke's company in Hobart, in Sydney at the Theatre Royal in opera and concerts, and in Melbourne at the Queen's Theatre in 1853.\(^ {33}\) She appeared regularly as a concert artist and in opera in the 1850s, and then took an opera and concert troupe on an extensive tour throughout the Australian colonies, New Zealand, India and the USA,\(^{34}\) making the most of her entrepreneurial skills as well as her vocal training and stage experience. Madame Carandini's daughter Rosina (Mrs Palmer) studied with Frank Packer in Hobart\(^ {35}\) and then with her mother. She taught in Melbourne privately for many years.\(^ {36}\) Palmer's daughter, Mrs Gilbert Wilson, also reached prominence as a singer, and became a vocal teacher in Brisbane. She appeared in Sydney in concert in 1896, where the critics reviewed her well:

There was also a charming addition to the concert in the presence of Mrs Gilbert Wilson, the vocalist who as the grand-daughter of Madame Carandini, and the daughter of Mrs Palmer (Miss Rosina Carandini), had a host of claims on the musical public yet needed none but her own powers to assure her welcome.\(^ {37}\)

Such reviews demonstrate the longevity of this branch of the traditional Italian school, showing that a definite understanding of technique was being passed down to subsequent generations of singers and teachers. In 1932 Wilson was given a tributary seventieth birthday party by the Lord Mayor (Alderman J. W. Greenel) to celebrate her life work and her enormous contribution to music making in Brisbane.\(^ {38}\) More detailed examination of Brisbane newspapers and musical writing is necessary before the contribution of the teaching of Wilson may be

\(^{29}\) Hall and Cripps, *Sydney Stage* 119.

\(^{30}\) *Sydney Morning Herald* 26 Apr. 1916: 13

\(^{31}\) Jane Raper's pupils include Miss Bethell and Miss Griffiths, who both took part in concerts, and light opera performances between 1891 and 1920. *Sydney Mail* 6 June 1891: 1256.


\(^{34}\) Ross, 'Singing and Society' 123.

\(^{35}\) Bebbington, 'Carandini' 98.

\(^{36}\) Reba Rangan, Gertie Kearns, Ivy Sears, Jessie Cromb, Lady Clark, and Lady Rupert Clarke, and her daughter, Mrs Gilbert Wilson, are all of Palmer's students that are currently known. *Australian Musical News* 10 (1920): 159.

\(^{37}\) *Sydney Mail* 22 Aug. 1896: 386.

\(^{38}\) *Australian Musical News* 22 (1932): 17.
accurately understood. It is clear, however, that the influence of Isaac Nathan's teaching of traditional Italian technique may be seen in the work of Mrs Wilson as a singer and later teacher some four 'vocal generations' later.

Some of the most important and influential teachers of the traditional Italian technique in Australia were Australian-born singers who, having shown exceptional talent, were sent overseas to study with teachers of the traditional Italian technique. In many cases, they came back to Australia as performers or teachers. Lucy Chambers (1840–1894), a contralto, was one of these singers.39 Her first singing teacher, Miss Logan of Sydney, was the cousin of composer Vincent Wallace (the brother of Eliza Wallace) and a pupil of Logier in piano.40 Chambers sang for the Irish soprano Catherine Hayes during her first tour to Australia, and Hayes was so impressed that she offered to supervise Chambers' further studies in Italy.41 The offer was at first declined, but in 1862 after the death of her father, Chambers went to London and studied with the younger Garcia, and then to Italy, where she studied with Pietro Romani, Vanrucini and Giovanni Battista Lamperti.42 She made her professional debut in 1864 in the part of Azucena in Il Trovatore in the Teatro Pagliano, and during her European career sang in Lucca, Milan, Venice, Bologna, Turin, Zagreb, Portugal, Germany and Belgium. The impresario William Saurin Lyster met Chambers on a recruiting trip to Milan in August 1869, and invited her back to Australia to join his opera company.43

In 1871, Chambers began movement towards retirement from the stage in order to begin a career in teaching.44 She was still singing for Lyster, in roles such as Azucena and Maffeo Orsini, but gradually began to concentrate on teaching. Her most widely known student was Alice Rees (who became wife to the conductor Max Vogrich). Rees had an excellent voice with the potential to become a world-class performer. She curtailed her own performance career, however, in order to support her husband, who enjoyed considerable success in Europe and America. A Sydney Mail review of one of Rees's performances for the Sydney Liedertafel demonstrates her vocal capacity:

Madame Vogrich, whose every appearance affords evidence of advancement in style, sang in exquisite voice and phrasing, the brilliant polonaise from 'Mignon.' The sportive grace of this song from the 'Fairy Queen' was admirably reproduced by the singer, while the refinement of the interpretation was apparent throughout. The florid passages were given with clear neatness rarely equaled, and showing high culture as well as fresh purity of voice.45

Again, the review presents a positive account of the thorough artistic and technical facility in the performance of a singer wholly trained in Australia, demonstrating clear florid singing, as well as artistic control. Rees taught in Sydney privately, and appeared regularly in concerts.

---

39 Jennifer Royle, 'Chambers, Lucy,' OCAM 108.
42 Humphreys (ed.), Men of the Time 27.
44 Love, Golden Age 203.
45 Sydney Mail 27 June 1885: 1354.
while her husband conducted the Sydney Liedertafel. They both left Sydney in 1886, and travelled to London, then America. Rees later joined the staff at the University of Melbourne Conservatorium from 1924 to 1929 before going overseas with her husband again.

Other students of Lucy Chambers included Marie St Clair, Ada Gardiner, Alice Dunning Lingnard, Ada Walker, and Ida Osborne. Most of these women sang roles with the Lyster Company and other comic opera companies in Sydney and Melbourne, and had reasonable success. Owing to the destruction of records held at the University of Melbourne it is difficult to find more information about the Australian pupils of Alice Rees-Vogrich. It is likely, however, that several students of Rees will be found who form another generation in this branch of the traditional Italian school in Australia. The line of pedagogy from Romani, the younger Garcia, Vannucini, and Lamperti through Lucy Chambers to Rees could not be more direct.

Throughout the 1860s, many of the Italian-trained singers, both of the Lyster Company and of other smaller visiting companies, taught singing in Australia, and this was another important source of the traditional Italian school for Australian vocal pedagogy. The tenor Pietro Cecchi came to Australia with the touring company of the American soprano Agatha States, in 1872. Cecchi had (like Lucy Chambers) studied with Pietro Romani in Florence, and had performed as a leading tenor throughout Italy and Europe before joining the ‘States Company’ in America. Romani, as maestro concertare to the impresario Lanari of the Teatro della Pergola in Florence, had worked with Rossini, Verdi, and Bellini, and had also coached singers such as Julia Grisi, Gilbert Duprez and Adolphe Nourrit.

Cecchi remained in Melbourne and made a living from teaching after the tour for the States Company finished. His most famous student was Helen Mitchell (Melba). Cecchi’s studio was at Allans, and his other students included Billy Nelson, Harry Atkinson Fitts, Margaret Laidlaw, Mr J.G. Wright, Isabelle Bredin and Madame Mainwaring. Bredin and Mainwaring both taught singing in Melbourne, but neither seem to have produced any spectacular students. Melba had many successful pupils, who taught throughout Australia after 1915, and should be considered part of Cecchi’s lineage, owing to the fact that Melba studied for seven years with Cecchi, and for only six to nine months with Marchesi. This lineage produced singers and teachers who worked all over Australia, including Western Australia (Gertrude Hutton), Sydney (Ruth Ladd), and Melbourne (Gertrude Johnson).
Williams, Stella Power, Elsa Stralia). The influences of this school are present in Australian vocal pedagogy to this day.

One of the most influential pupils of the younger Garcia in Australia was Mary Ellen Christian, who migrated to Australia in 1871 on medical advice after having suffered a respiratory illness. She toured with the visiting French violinist Jennie Claus, and the English pianist Arabella Goddard, and appeared after this as a concert singer, and frequently as a soloist with the Melbourne Philharmonic and Sydney Liedertafel. In 1889, after performing in Elijah with Charles Santley in Sydney during his tour, Christian retired to teach. In 1894 she became a Sister at the church of Mary Paul-of-the-Cross. After further study in England with Garcia, she founded the Garcia school of Music at Potts Point, Sydney, in 1905, which became an important destination for young singers seeking training from the Garcia School. Christian's standards of vocal training, learned from Garcia, considerably improved the standard of vocal teaching available in Melbourne and Sydney before the opening of the state conservatoria, and several of Christian's pupils had successful international careers as performers, although they do not seem to have contributed significantly to the lineage later in the role of teachers. Christian was also Melba's first singing teacher in Melbourne at the Presbyterian Ladies College, where some important fundamentals of technique were instilled into the unruly young girl.

Madame Emery Gould, a soprano who had trained under the elder Garcia, was also a prominent vocal teacher in Melbourne in the 1890s. Among Gould's pupils were Lucy Benson, the daughter of singer Fanny Lempriere Pringle, who became a singing teacher, organist, and choral conductor in Hobart (receiving praise from Amy Sherwin for her vocal teaching) and John William Bartie, who also advertised his Garcia School of Singing in Melbourne in the 1920s. Considerable work is still required in order fully to document the lineages of students produced by Benson in Tasmania and the other pupils of Gould in Melbourne.

---

60 Anne Williams, whose first teacher was the Swedish contralto Agnes Janson (a pupil of Julius Gunter who had studied in Paris with Garcia) went to London to teach on Melba's advice. She was reputed as an incredible soprano and Melba was somewhat jealous of her voice and ability to teach. Williams taught many successful singers. As well as being Gertrude Johnson's main teacher, she taught Browning Mumumery, Edith Warburton and Irene Sartort, who all taught in Melbourne for many years, producing internationally successful opera singers between them.


63 Radic, *Melba* 15.

64 Students of Christian include Margaret McLennan, Eileen Lane, Rosie Fitzgerald, Gwendolyn Spanswick, Ilma Eliot, Gertrude Corr, Kathleen Harley, Nellie Duggan, Lilian Moore, Molly de Gunst (who studied with Christian for nine years at Potts Point: see Alison Gyger, *Opera for the Antipodes; Opera in Australia 1881-1939* (Sydney: Currency Press, 1990) 291-92; De Gunst later appeared in opera performances with the J.C. Williamson Company during the 1930s), Marie Narelle (see Barbara and Findlay Mackenzie, *Singers of Australia from Melba to Sutherland* (Melbourne: Lansdowne Press, 1967) 74), Kate Rooney (who undertook further studies with Garcia: see Mackenzie 85), Carrie Lancelly, Gertrude Concannon (who was popular as a soloist in Sydney during the 1920s) and Christie Fuller (who sang in Sydney in light opera and concerts for many years: see *Table Talk* 21 Aug. 1885: 6).


66 Diana Large, 'Pringle, Fanny Lempriere,' *Australian Dictionary of Biography*, vol. 7 (Melbourne: University of Melbourne Press, 1979) 272–73.

Elise Wiedermann, a pupil of Mathilde Marchesi, had a more far-reaching influence on vocal pedagogy in Australia, and is arguably the most influential source of the Marchesi/Garcia technique in Australia. She came to Australia in 1880 with her husband-to-be, Carl Ludwig Pinschosf, for the Melbourne International Exhibition. Wiedermann, born in Vienna on August 31, 1851, had studied at the Conservatorium of Vienna, and had sung on the operatic stages of Vienna, Zurich, Brunswick, Hannover, Hamburg, London and Leipzig. She had been successful as a performer; however after her marriage and Pinschof’s appointment as Consul for Austria-Hungary in Victoria, she was required by the Austrian government to cease performing professionally in public, as it was considered inappropriate for the wife of a man of Pinschof’s station to appear on the stage. In Wiedermann’s obituary, a comment on her technique and vocal prowess quoted from a speech by Marshall-Hall helps to put into perspective the skills she imparted to her pupils:

The more I hear this lady, in both private and public, the more I am impressed with her splendid dramatic @. A pure, dear resonant tone, equally cultivated from top to bottom of her voice, not extraordinarily powerful, but penetrating, is joined to an admirable system of vocalization, and most thoroughly trained exactness. Her cantabile is the perfection of evenness joined to expressiveness, a rare combination; while the melodic outline is preserved intact, each word, each consonant, each interval receives its proper characterisation—even as the rocks are marked on the unbroken surface of a stream by the endless curves of the smooth flowing water.

If Wiedermann was able to impart half of her own training to her pupils, she was able to assist them considerably. Some of the above characteristics are still sought for in vocal circles in Melbourne, as a direct result of the lineage.

In 1895, Marshall-Hall persuaded Wiedermann to teach at the new University-affiliated Conservatorium of Music in Melbourne. She joined the staff, and remained loyal to Marshall-Hall despite his difficulties after the publication of Hymns Ancient and Modern, and even after he lost the support of the University Council, after which his tenure of the Ormond Chair was not renewed. Wiedermann helped Marshall-Hall to form the Albert Street Conservatorium in 1900, and then returned to the University Conservatorium with him in 1915 after the death of Franklin Peterson. Many of Wiedermann’s pupils became professional singing teachers and singers, and some were still teaching in the 1950s, having taught hundreds of students.

---

69 Middleman, ‘Wiedermann’ 234.
72 Among Wiedermann’s pupils were Florence Austral, Elsa (Fischer) Stralia, Evelyn Scotney, Stella Power, Aimee Elvins, Mrs Alberto Zelman (Maude Harrington), Mrs Patten (Alice King), Elsie Dickinson, Clarice Malyon, Mary Campbell, Marguerite Henderson, and Wiedermann’s own three daughters, two of whom had successful performance careers as Carmen and Louise Pascova (see Violet C.E. Parkinson, ‘Madame Elise Wiedermann and the Opera School,’ Con Amore [magazine of the Melba Conservatorium] 12 (1954): 7; Middleman, Australian Musical News 234). Other students of Wiedermann’s were Lucy Rowe, Ruby Gray, Violet Clarke, Kitty Noon, Ruby Blyth, Anne McLeod, Anne McDonald, Ivy Bickford, Madge Boys, Margaret Murdoch, Lovie Mueller, Vera Bedford, Hesketh Jones, Elsa Warman, Florence Ballara (Towl), Kate Benda, and Mona Sydna.
between them. Florence Austral sang at Covent Garden and across Europe, and Evelyn Scotney, after further training with Marchesi, sang with the Boston Opera Company and then the Metropolitan Opera Company in America. Through her close association with the two main Melbourne conservatoria, and her skilled teaching of so many pupils, Wiedermann imprinted Marchesi's influence on generations to come, in some cases leading to eight or more 'generations' of singers. There are singers all over Australia who are the product of this particular lineage.

The lineages of vocal pedagogy produced in Australia by teachers and singers of the traditional Italian technique, and in particular the pupils of Marchesi and Garcia, were popular and successful in Australia between 1850 and 1900. Although English cultural and social standards were dominant in music and other social activities, vocal standards were increasingly founded on traditional Italian technique, especially where operatic vocal production was concerned. In tracing the lineages of vocal pedagogy throughout Australia, it has been possible to evaluate the relationship between Italian technical training and professional singers in Australia at that time. The traditional Italian school gained prominence all over Australia. Its influence was felt even in the largely German-dominated musical society of Adelaide, in Hobart and the musical centers of Sydney, and in particular Melbourne, where Wiedermann's pupils were an important source of Italian technique for following generations of singers.

---

74 Kay Dreyfus, 'Scotney, Evelyn,' OCAM 505.