

advocating new ways of thinking about sound and listening and Judith Tick (author of the recent biography of Ruth Crawford Seeger) outlining feminist biographical approaches to the woman composer.¹² Such cooperation between theorists and historicists, activists and conservatives within the auspices of the national society should be a lantern to Australian observers. In a famous debate more than twenty years ago between literary scholars Carolyn Heilbrun (on the side of the feminist biographers) and Catharine Stimpson (speaking for theorists), it was concluded that both camps are necessary to the health of the discipline. They drew an analogy with the Old and New Testaments, finally agreeing that 'only the Jeremiahs of the feminist critique can lead us out of the "Egypt of female servitude" to the promised land of the feminist vision.'¹³ With a fourth Composing Women conference scheduled for 2001 it is to be hoped that visions will be realised.

SUZANNE ROBINSON

¹² 'Report on the Open Meeting of the Committee on the Status of Women,' *AMS Newsletter* 30.1 (February 2000): 5.

¹³ See Carolyn G. Heilbrun and Catharine R. Stimpson, 'Theories of Feminist Criticism,' in *Feminist Literary Criticism: Explorations in Theory*, ed. Josephine Donovan (Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 1976) 64, 68 and 72, and Elaine Showalter, 'Toward a Feminist Poetics,' *The New Feminist Criticism: Essays on Women, Literature and Theory*, ed. Elaine Showalter (London: Virago, 1986) 125-143.

Greta Mary Hair and Robyn E. Smith (eds), *Songs of the Dove and the Nightingale: Sacred and Secular Music c.900–c.1600* Australian Studies in History, Philosophy & Social Studies of Music 3
Sydney: Currency Press, 1994.
ISBN 0 86819 409 3. xii+278pp., index, app., ill.

Songs of the Dove and the Nightingale is a collection of papers by leading early music scholars on repertoires spanning the period from the earliest surviving plainchant sources to the late renaissance. The wide range of subject matter treated in this volume is the result of the papers having originated at the Symposium of the International Musicological Society held in Melbourne in 1988. Strictly speaking, this volume is a proceedings, and, generally speaking, conference proceedings attract less attention as review material than other types of publication. What perhaps makes this volume stand out is that, while not the only collection of early music studies with Australian overtones,¹ it is unusual to see a volume of papers on European early-music traditions published in Australia. Here, the editors, Australian Robyn E. Smith and Australian-born Greta Mary Hair, have recast the foci of the Symposium simply as 'sacred' and 'secular' for the benefit of a wider readership.

The volume is divided into three parts. The first part concerns the sacred realm, represented by the dove, with papers drawn from the session 'Medieval Liturgical Chant: Recent Research Findings.' The second part concerns the secular realm, represented by the nightingale, with papers from the session 'Analogy: Structural Relations between Music and Text.' In especial

¹ See for example the volumes dedicated to Australian musicologist Gordon Anderson, *Gordon Athol Anderson 1929–1981: In Memoriam von Seinen Studenten, Freunden und Kollegen*, 2 vols, *Wissenschaftliche Abhandlungen* 39/1–2 (Henryville, Ottawa & Binnigen: Institute of Mediaeval Music, 1984).

deference to the function of the volume as a conference proceedings, the third part is a reproduction of the Symposium Concert Program which formed part of the Festival of Music, also held in Melbourne in 1988. With the wide range of topics and approaches in the papers, Smith and Hair have provided an element of homogeneity through presentation; each paper begins with an abstract, and individual sections and conclusions within papers are clearly demarcated.

Part One of the volume—recent findings in liturgical chant research—is dominated by works in progress, with an emphasis on initial codicological findings. The volume opens with Bonifacio Baroffio's 'The Musical Repertories of the Liturgy of Southern Italy and Beneventan Sources,' a biographical overview of principal sources and potential influences upon the Beneventan/Southern Italian repertories, as well as methodological recommendations for approaching non-Gregorian chant bodies. This is followed by studies of specific sources. In 'A New Source for the Antiphonale Missarum,' Max Lütolf presents his preliminary findings, including reproductions of the twenty-six hands identified, on an eleventh-century German antiphonale missarum acquired during the mid-eighties by the Episcopal Ordinariat Archive, Basel. In 'The Missal of a Church Adjacent to the Lateran: Roma Archivio di Stato, MS Sanctissimo Salvatore 997,' Pierre-Marie Gy considers the relationship between the now lost twelfth-century Lateran missal in ms Sanctissimo Salvatore 997 and the chant traditions surrounding the Lateran canons from Lucca. These studies are followed by Paul Anthony Luke Boncella's paper, 'Regino Prumiensis and the Tones,' in which the issue of early conceptions of mode is considered in relation to the writings of Regino of Prüm and Aurelian of Réôme. In the final paper of Part One, 'What the Dove Could not yet Sing: Alleluia Melodies after 1100,' Karlheinz Schlager explores the question of stylistic consistency between alleluia melodies included in his edition *Alleluia-Melodien II ab 1100*, Monumenta Monodica Medii Aevi 8 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1987).

The papers in Part Two—text-music relations within secular traditions—cover a broad range of text-music concerns beginning with text-based word-music relations. In 'Interrelationships between Text and Music in the Refrain Forms of Guillaume de Machaut,' Marie-Louise Göllner looks at the interchange of stylistic devices between music and text in a selection of Machaut's ballads and virelais. This is followed by Robyn Smith's study of punctuation in thirteenth-century motet sources, 'Semantics, Structure or a Manner of Speaking?,' which draws on Martha Parrott's position on the distinction between the modern syntactical function of punctuation and the performative one assumed in medieval redaction. Fiona McAlpine's 'A Hard Look at Trouvère Melodic Style,' distances melodies from the textual attributes of the words to which they are set, and draws on Schenkerian analysis to represent hitherto unobserved correspondences between musical syntagms in songs by Thibaut de Champagne.

Another focus in Part Two is the relationship between the musical practices and literary sources that surround various traditions. Here, Keith Polk's 'From Oral to Written: Change in Transmission of Instrumental Music in Fifteenth-Century Europe,' looks at a range of issues surrounding instrumental ensembles from 1430 to 1500, including categories of ensembles, oral/written transmission and cultural interchange throughout Europe, with an emphasis on German ensembles. Ingrid Brainard's paper, 'Sir John Davies' *Orchestra* as a Dance Historical

Source,' re-examines Davies' poem in light of contemporaneous source material on dance from the Elizabethan period. The final paper is Eugene Casjen Cramer's 'Two Motets Attributed to Tomás Luis de Victoria in Italian Sources: An Introductory Study,' in which two anonymous motets are ascribed to Victoria, based on codicological evidence and the consistency of idiosyncratic 'stylistic features' between the two motets and Victoria's known repertory.

While a volume of this kind can be recommended to those with interests in the individual studies therein, in many ways this type of volume is particularly useful for those less well-read in early music scholarship. All papers are presented in English translation, with foreign language quotations given with footnoted translation. This gives the less-than-multilingual reader immediate access to the writings of scholars such as Baroffio, Lütolf and Gy who normally publish in their first language.

Another facet of this volume is the wide range of approaches used to present histories of musical texts, something which is not readily gauged by early music textbooks, many of which give a history of a specific period without expounding on the approaches taken towards rendering that history. An obvious exception to this is Mark Everist's, (ed.), *Models of Musical Analysis: Music Before 1600* (Oxford & Cambridge: Blackwell, 1992), which takes as a focus the demonstration of specific analytical approaches within the same time frame as the present volume. A difference here is that, in the present volume, many of the basic concerns for the study of early music—including codicology, word-music relationships, melodic style, historical significance and text authentication—are broached in one way or another. These concerns continue to dominate the study of early music even as the popularity of multi-disciplinary approaches widens. In particular, codicological issues pervade the volume, issues with which early music scholars, irrespective of methodological biases, are expected to be able to deal competently.

I have one small reservation with the volume. The papers by Baroffio and Cramer include significant discussion of individual examples without illustration of what is described. In the case of Baroffio's paper, there is also inadequate reference to the versions of the chants discussed. Further, there are several examples which are unreadable. Although larger reproductions of these are provided at the end of the volume, preservation of the unreadable examples unfortunately diminishes the quality of the volume slightly.

Hair and Smith are, nonetheless, successful in bringing together papers displaying a range of often disparate approaches and subjects into a coherent and very readable volume. What they have ended up with is a collection of insightful early music scholarship by leading scholars which can be recommended to both the early music specialist and non-specialist alike.

CATHERINE JEFFREYS