Sacred or Profane: The Influence of Vatican Legislation on Music in the Catholic Archdiocese of Melbourne, 1843–1938
John Byrne, MMus, Australian Catholic University, 2005

Despite the authoritative and very explicit directions from the Vatican in 1903, the Catholic Archdiocese of Melbourne successfully resisted the demands for a major reform of liturgical Church music for thirty-five years. This thesis examines the reasons for this strong and effective resistance to the demands of the Holy See, and shows that despite being complex and interrelated these reasons can be summarised under two fundamental headings.

The thesis examines the broad spectrum of music performed in the Melbourne Archdiocese, but, because of the limited availability of information and the prime importance of the two principal churches of the Archdiocese, it concentrates on St Patrick’s Cathedral and St Francis’s Church. The thesis also examines in detail the documents of the Holy See concerning liturgical music that were relevant to musical practice in Melbourne. Special attention is drawn to the influential Motu proprio *Tra le sollecitudini* (1903) issued by Pope Pius X. The time span of this thesis covers the ninety-five years from March 1843, when the first music was sung in Melbourne’s only Catholic church, to 1938, when Archbishop Daniel Mannix ordered the reforms to liturgical music as demanded by the Vatican.

The thesis demonstrates that the resistance to the reform of liturgical music in the Catholic Archdiocese of Melbourne was due to two influences. The first was the fact that the new freedom and wealth that the immigrant Irish community of the Archdiocese of Melbourne experienced enabled it to establish churches and liturgies whose grandeur and artistic excellence symbolised their success in establishing a major new social and cultural status in their new home. Church music was one of the great manifestations of this and, as an integral part of their new significance and sense of achievement, it was to be jealously guarded. The second was the matter of authority and the independence of the Catholic bishops from the dictates and interference of the Vatican authorities. These Irish-born bishops were trained in an historical milieu in Ireland and Europe that fostered a fierce pride in the value of autonomy from external and alien authority. In this they were given a great degree of protection by the isolation of Australia and its distance from outside authority. In this Archbishops Carr and
Mannix both proved to be strongly independent leaders who proved to be most reluctant to implement reforms imposed by the Vatican automatically.

The thesis shows that only in the fourth decade of the twentieth century was Episcopal authority finally brought to bear to make reforms to liturgical music a reality in the Catholic Church in Melbourne.

‘Semper sint in flore:’ Historical, Organisational, Individual and Musical Aspects of the Intervarsity Choral Movement in Australia

Peter Campbell, PhD, University of Melbourne, 2004

Although the roots of its member choirs go back into the nineteenth century, the Australian intervarsity choral movement can be dated from 1950, when a combined concert featuring the Sydney University Musical Society and the Melbourne University Choral Society was presented in Sydney. Choral singing has long been recognised as one of the most enduring and participative forms of musical expression. Although during the nineteenth century choral societies were, at times, seen as elitist and insular, during the twentieth century, choirs have come to prominence for their ability to establish networks between disparate sectors of the population, and as vehicles for community well-being and pride. Due to the inherently inclusive nature of singing, and the wide variety of skill levels and musical genres that choral organisations can encompass, choirs have been linked to such universal benefits as increased social cohesiveness and mass participation in culture. Since 1950, the intervarsity movement has developed into a substantial organisation that offers a major annual festival that is attended by members of the student-run choirs at twelve of Australia’s universities.

Ignited by the commemorations marking Australian bicentennial in 1988 and the centenary of Federation in 2001, Australia’s professional musical organisations have received increased musicological attention. The recent push to document and preserve our cultural heritage has included many amateur musical pursuits, but this thesis is the first to investigate Australia’s intervarsity choral festivals in this light. The intervarsity choral movement has made a significant contribution to Australian musical life and culture, and this study aims to document its nature, its history and its achievements in order to make it more widely known and to prepare it for inclusion in broader histories of cultural practice. Substantial appendices have been included in order to bring together such information as currently exists on the movement. This documentation is currently dispersed and in danger of being lost.

The movement is examined from four perspectives: its place in the historical record of choral music in Australia; its organisational and structural development and the relationship of this to broader cultural change in the community; the musical and social background of its participants; and the repertoire performed at, commissioning of works for, and critical reception of its public performances. The data examined here suggest that the movement has played an important role in the education of choristers, the engagement of the public in musical presentations, the creation of new performance opportunities for emerging artists—particularly conductors—and the continued viability of Australian composition through a sustained and vibrant program of commissions granted to established as well as early-career composers. The
thesis shows that far from being of only passing interest, the Australian intervarsity choral movement has been of central importance to the cultural achievements of several generations of choristers and professional musicians in this country.

Music as Dialogue: Bakhtin’s Model Applied to Tippett’s
*A Child of Our Time*

Anne Marshman, PhD, University of Melbourne, 2005

This thesis proposes a model for an approach to music that is informed by the work of Russian theorist, Mikhail Bakhtin. Central to Bakhtinian thought is the concept of dialogue. Though the term is most frequently employed by Bakhtin to refer to the verbal phenomena of language and literature, it can be traced to his more fundamental conceptualisation of human relations and the perception of meaning. Part One of the thesis explores these philosophical roots before outlining a theoretical framework for a dialogic approach to music. Bakhtin’s model of the utterance, conceived as the basic unit of dialogic communication whose meaning is contingent on such factors as the ideological and social genealogy of genre, the representation and interaction of socially constituted voices (Bakhtin’s ‘heteroglossia’), and the unique perception of the individual receiver at a certain time and place, is borrowed for music.

A case study demonstrating the dialogical analysis of a specific musical utterance, that is, the 1944 premiere of Michael Tippett’s oratorio *A Child of Our Time* forms the second part of the thesis. It considers disjunctions and contradictions in the work (previously dismissed as shortcomings of the score) in terms of their tangible links to historical reality and explains intertextual allusions as the manifestation of cultural, social, and political heteroglossia. An examination of the oratorio genre’s ideological evolution accounts for certain idiosyncrasies of the form and for aspects of the 1944 audience’s expectations of musical and textual materials. ‘Official’ responses to *A Child of Our Time*’s premiere and the potential influence of pre-reception material on critics and other audience members are examined in a critical reception study. By analysing the unique semantic contributions of a range of voices (including composer, historical listener, and an array of heteroglossia of past and present) that comprise the musical utterance, the case study aims to reveal multiple layers of hermeneutic potential to contemporary listeners.

The conclusion evaluates Part One’s theoretical framework and its application in Part Two, and makes suggestions for the model’s future potential.

Henry Cowell (1897–1965) and the Impact of his First European Tour, 1923

Victor Rischitelli, MMus, Australian Catholic University, 2005

In 1923, American composer and pianist, Henry Cowell gave a highly successful concert tour of Europe, playing his own unique compositions. This thesis discusses the impact of this tour, which has been discussed only briefly before, although it had an enormous impact.
I examine this tour in detail, especially the concerts in Vienna, Berlin, Paris and London, discussing how and why Cowell created such an impact, not only during the tour but also immediately following it. I discuss musical life in Europe and I compare his piano music to the piano music that was being heard at the time. When Cowell embarked on his tour, he introduced new piano techniques, some of which are discussed in his treatise *New Musical Resources* (1919). His piano works were mainly a showcase of his new techniques. His clusters, string-piano technique and, to some degree, his experiments with time and metre, arguably influenced further generations of composers. Cowell’s music drew such passionate responses from the Europeans that when he returned to America attitudes toward him and his music had changed for the better.

In Europe, Cowell was impressed by the various societies and publications devoted to new music and, as a result, he founded in America the New Music Society and New Music Quarterly. These gave recognition to mostly American composers devoted to the development of avant-garde music. Cowell provided a foundation for the development of American music; without this, we may not have been privy to the impressive music that came from this part of the world during the first half of the twentieth century.

The Dodo was Really a Phoenix: The Renaissance and Revival of the Recorder in England, 1879–1941

Alexandra Williams, PhD, University of Melbourne, 2004

This study provides a critical analysis of the modern renaissance and popularisation of the recorder in England, examining the phenomena and placing them within their broader musical and cultural contexts. It explores the roles of the principal protagonists and institutions, arguing that a confluence of different agendas—musical, educational and social—with an environment of changing conditions, was crucial to the successful revival of an instrument, which in Victorian England had no living tradition at all.

There was a clear relationship between late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century scholarship on the recorder and the desire to learn more about England’s ‘golden age’ of music during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. Even before the 1870s, scholars represented the recorder as an obsolete instrument. By the 1890s, and particularly from 1900, there were a few people playing the instrument in public, most notably Canon Galpin and Arnold Dolmetsch. Unquestionably, Dolmetsch’s work with the recorder between 1900 and the late 1920s was crucial to the subsequent mass revival.

Changes in educational ideas and doctrine between the World Wars led to children’s music classes including active instrumental music making, in part to stimulate a sense of cultural identity. From 1926 the bamboo pipe gradually became the melodic instrument most commonly used in English schools, until Edgar Hunt, inspired by Arnold Dolmetsch’s Haslemere concerts, conceived of a popular recorder revival. Hunt began to import inexpensive German recorders, and to research and publish pre-Classical recorder music. From 1935 the recorder began to usurp the place of the bamboo pipe in English elementary schools.
Concurrently, musical and educational authorities were encouraging domestic music making, for social and musically nationalistic reasons, often linking it with Elizabethan music making. The idea that a strong musical knowledge across all demographics could enable the nation to become ‘a land with music’ once more was invoked in many of the activities undertaken between the wars. The work of the Society of Recorder Players, established in 1937, was significant, and had long-term consequences for the success of the popular revival, as well as for the relative status of the recorder. At the same time, classes established by Edgar Hunt at Trinity College of Music, as well as new compositions for the recorder, helped to legitimise the instrument.

This thesis addresses a number of gaps in previous research by exploring thoroughly the history of the recorder in England between 1879 and 1941 utilising extensive primary source materials (many hitherto overlooked), by examining linkages between the recorder’s increasing usage and the various strands of the English musical renaissance, and by determining why the recorder was so highly popular when other instruments—notably the bamboo pipe—appeared to have similar attributes.